



The Munich Security Conference 2018: An Overview

*Dr. Indrani Talukdar**

The 54th Munich Security Conference took place on 16-18 February in Munich this year. Leaders and experts from all around the world came to participate in this annual event on international security policyⁱ. The motto of the conference was “To the Brink and Back?”

- The themes that were discussed during the MSC 2018 were the prospects of future European cooperation in security policy as well as persistent threats to the liberal international order, global economic order with the focus on protectionism, technology’s impact on democracy, security challenges in the Sahel region and in Central and Eastern Europe, as well as nuclear arms control issues and the continued threat posed by jihadist terrorism and caliphatisim. China’s One Belt and One Road initiative was discussed along with closed door sessions on power politics in Arctic, enduring values of the rules-based international order and impact of technology on the international order. During the conference MSC Chairman Wolfgang Ischinger was honoured by the Carnegie Corporation and the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace with the fourth Nunn-Lugar Award for promoting nuclear security.
- During the conference, a report was introduced that emphasised the various challenges the world is facing that is moving towards the brink of a significant conflict.
- The themes of 2018 are in the similar lines of that of 2017ⁱⁱ given the continuation of the challenges. This paper highlights the main points made by the participants.

Main Points were:

- The MSC 2018 conference’s main focus was on Europe—its strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and challenges.
- The German and the French minister emphasised the willingness and responsibility both Germany and France want to take up for Europe’s security.

- The focus of the European participants was more on Europe than transatlantic. Germany sent a strong message by envisioning Europe as a strong, independent and unified region bound by common causes and purposes. To become a strong power, it is necessary for Europe to address internal conflicts the region was facing.
- President Jean-Claude Juncker of European Commissionⁱⁱⁱ said that for EU to become a strong organisation, the member countries should work upon taking unanimous decisions.
- To deconstruct any picture of a weakening transatlantic partnership because of the focus on Europe by Germany and France, NATO Secretary General Jens Stoltenberg^{iv} said that the partnership between North America and Europe has grown stronger which is seen through the stationing of US troops in the region. For example, more than 6000 US troops are deployed in Poznan, Poland^v. In addition, he said that that the EU's efforts on defence should not be taken as an alternative to NATO. Rather it is complementary.
- Turkey's Prime Minister Binali Yildirim^{vi} said that in Syria, NATO allies are fighting against each other which is not conducive for peace and stability of West Asia.
- UK Prime Minister Theresa May^{vii} made it clear that though Brexit will happen, the UK will maintain close cooperation with EU through a deep and special partnership. The message that was shared by UK was that the relationship between the two should not weaken nor steer into competition but become strong once Brexit happens. To strengthen the partnership, independency and autonomy in both sides needs to be maintained, support to EU's enlargement process to be maintained and cooperation as equal partners in all aspects of the relationship to be maintained.
- France's Defence Minister Florence Parly also spoke of Europe taking responsibilities for its security and defence through operations and not just building of institutions. She said that "Europe is not a nice to have, it is a must" emphasising on the importance of Europe as a region and its contribution towards the peace and stability in the world order.
- Russia's Foreign Minister Sergey Lavrov spoke about the challenges between the country and Europe and suggested EU adopt independent policy-making. Russia is open to an equal partnership with the EU based on mutual respect and a balance of interests in order to find effective responses to modern-day challenges. It is also willing to promote its relations with the US and all other countries based on these principles.
- Herbert Raymond McMaster^{viii}, Lieutenant General, National Security Advisor to the President of US spoke about the geopolitical challenges the world is facing due to rogue regimes which possess mass destruction weapons, actions of the revisionist powers and spread of jihadism. To address these problems and to protect the world order from crumbling, he suggested that the US, its allies and partners should form a collective group and adopt a collective approach to fight against these challenges—by ensuring the non-proliferation of weapons of mass destruction and deterring their use; defeating jihadist terrorist organizations and strengthening the international foundations for peace and prosperity.
- Ukraine spoke about Russia as an existential threat to the world order. According to the Ukrainian president, Russian President Vladimir Putin's speech on 10 February 2007 at the 43rd MSC laid the foundation of destabilising the liberal world order. Resisting Russia with

a united Europe and world is important. The flag of EU was raised by the Ukrainian President Peter Poroshenko to indirectly suggest that Ukraine is an EU member. He referred to Ukraine as a key battlefield for the European order and security architecture, calling Kiev the 'sword and shield' of Europe. He encouraged an EU and NATO enlargement process.

- President Jean-Claude Juncker of European Commission^{ix} said that the Western Balkan countries are not yet prepared for EU enlargement process by 2019.
- The German Foreign Minister, Sigmar Gabriel^x said that the maintenance of the liberal world order is important otherwise the vision of other non-Western countries vision of the order would create discomfort for the West.
- NATO Secretary General Jens Stoltenberg^{xi} also spoke about the resurfacing of nuclear threats, including proliferation of nuclear weapons, the violation of the INF treaty by Russia and North Korea's nuclear tests, in the current times. These threats lead to an unpredictable environment for the non-nuclear states, emphasised by Kersti Kaljulaid, President of Republic of Estonia^{xii}. She also said that the upgradation of nuclear systems through Artificial Intelligence is a future threat. A nuclear enrichment system or nuclear weapon developing system based on AI would be a catastrophe.
- To avoid a nuclear war, Fu Ying (Chairwoman of the Committee on Foreign Affairs of the National People's Congress, Parliament of the People's Republic of China; Member of the Advisory Council, Munich Security Conference) said that P5 must maintain global strategic stability, safeguard the non-proliferation regime and continue nuclear disarmament. Improvement in global good governance is necessary. Trust building amongst US, its allies and the non-US allies is important. The resolution of the Korean Peninsula issue is important. More efforts need to be put from all sides especially from the US and North Korean side. The root cause of the Korean problem lies in the Korean Armistice Agreement, signed on 27 July, 1953.
- Choo Mi-ae (Chairwoman, Minjoo Party of Korea; Member of the Committee on Foreign Relations and Unification of the National Assembly, Parliament of the Republic of Korea) said that South Korea would take serious steps towards positive engagements with North Korea post-Winter Olympics. (The Panmunjom Declaration of 27 April is the outcome of the various diplomatic steps taken by the two Korean leaders towards the resolution of the threat).
- During a panel discussion on "Nuclear Security: Out of (Arms) Control?" the representatives from Russia and the US spoke frankly about their respective country's nuclear position. The resurfacing mistrust between Russia and US on the nuclear front is also a grave issue. Russia's representative, Sergey Kislyak (First Deputy Chairman of the Committee on Foreign Affairs of the Council of Federation, Russian Federation; former Ambassador of the Russian Federation to the United States of America) said that Russia's nuclear doctrine has not changed. Under two conditions, it will use nuclear weapons: firstly, when Russia is attacked by nuclear or mass destruction weapons and secondly, if a conflict goes to a critical stage where the survival of the nation is questioned. Russian posture is classical defensive which the US is trying to deny it. All Russian nuclear programmes comply with INF Treaty and it is ready to have dialogue with the US.

- Meanwhile, US representative John Sullivan (Deputy Secretary of State, United States of America) said that the US sticks to the moratorium on nuclear test^{xiii}. The new thing in the US nuclear posture is the assessment of the security situations that have changed. The response to this assessment is to update the nuclear triad. US is not introducing new weapons. The weapons which Russia accuse US of such as the low yield submarine ballistic missiles has been in US programme for decades. Sea-launched cruise missiles are for US to respond to weapons and nuclear doctrine by other countries including Russia and China^{xiv} that are premised on using of shorter intermediate range and low yield weapons to engage in 'escalate-de-escalate' moves. The US will use nuclear weapons in response to the use of non-nuclear strategic weapons against America. It is the strategy of deterrence. America will not introduce new nuclear weapons and maintain the New START Treaty limits but update and modernise the triad.
- Blame game between US and Russia over the compliance of each other's nuclear disarmament was evident from the discussions between the two countries on nuclear arms control.
- On Cyber security, Russia's representative, Sergey Kislyak said that it is an important challenge for the world and the main threat comes from US and not Russia. The allegations on Russia about interfering in the elections of US and western countries are fantasies. Russia has kept the door of dialogue open with the US and America has to make the first move to bridge the gap as too much water has gone under the bridge.
- On Iran nuclear deal, US pointed out that it is a flawed deal because it doesn't talk about control on ballistic missiles which poses a danger to the security in the region. Tehran is accused of misusing the JCPOA fund for the terrorist activities.
- During the panel discussion on global economic order^{xv}, the talk was on the positive economic growth in the global level. The world is witnessing a 3.9 per cent growth rate and is forecasted to remain so in 2019. However, at the same time, the impending challenges the panellists pointed out were "high inflation rate, increased rates of interests^{xvi}, asset bubbles, inclusiveness around globalisation, securing ownership amongst people who had created the global economic system^{xvii}, poverty eradication, inequality, over leverage, pensions, protectionism etc." According to them, these problems will lead to another financial crisis like the 2008. There will be added deficit and increase in debt despite the growth rate.
- The panel on global economic order said that the geopolitical challenges have the power to derail the global economic growth.
- Frans Timmermans (First Vice President of the European Commission and Commissioner for Better Regulation) said that Europe must not adopt protectionism. The world must return back to a 'win-win' situation.^{xviii}
- The panel on on global economic order also said that potential geopolitical challenges are in West Asia, South China Sea, and Korean Peninsula along with non-state actors and cyber attacks that threaten the global economic and international order.
- China's increasing global leadership, OBOR initiative^{xix}, its technology and innovation agenda^{xx} are important areas to be focused upon and to be concerned about. The German Foreign Minister, Sigmar Gabriel said that OBOR is an "attempt to establish a

comprehensive system for shaping the world in Chinese interest. It is no longer about economy but a Chinese development of a comprehensive system alternative to the Western one, which, is not based on freedom, democracy and individual human rights”.

- On West Asia, Sheikh Tamim Bin Hamad Al-Thani, Amir of the State of Qatar^{xxi} said that the reasons behind instability and terrorism having a fertile ground in the region are because of lack of social and economic progress; growing sectarian divisions; regional rivalries and shifting engagement from external powers. He added two more reasons which were recklessness and no framework for providing shared security. Apart from these, the regional rivalry between the major regional players and lack of a set of solid governance principles and rule of law in the region has also added to the challenges. To stabilise West Asia, he suggested the need to agree on an inclusive baseline of co-existence, backed by binding arbitration mechanisms, and enforced by the collective body of the region like the EU model.
- Iranian Foreign Minister Mohammad Javad Zarif^{xxii} said that terrorism needs to be defeated by defeating the ideology of hate and exclusion. Until and unless this factor is addressed, no matter how many terrorist groups like ISIS are eliminated, terrorism will continue to flourish.
- According to General Qamar Javed Bajwa^{xxiii}, Chief of Army Staff of the Pakistan jihadism is a product of the free liberal world where young men were radicalised in the West. To defeat it, Pakistan has adopted some measures such as military operations; generated public opinion to defeat the terrorists’ narrative; formulated the National Action Plan, aimed at fighting terrorism and gradually rooting out extremism and Operation Radd-ul-Fasaad in 2017 with its particular objectives—targeted kinetic and enhanced law enforcement operations to locate and destroy the residual terrorist presence across the country; comprises supporting the National Action Plan, that involves better prosecution, policing, education reforms, along with curbing terror financing and hate speech and discrediting the terrorist ideology including the misuse of the terms like Jihad and Caliphate. For Pakistan, jihadism or terrorism is a reality and prevalent in the society. Despite the Pakistani Army’s efforts to defeat the terrorist groups, there are still active and sleeper cells who are residing in mountains, border towns and 54 refugee camps, besides some major towns and cities.
- On Afghanistan, General Qamar Javed Bajwa^{xxiv}, said that the stalemate in Afghanistan is because of the pulling-out of resources from the country after 2003. The stalemate in Afghanistan is not only due to the Haqqani Network or TTA but the pursuit of a wrong strategy. Safe havens in Afghanistan are still active for the Haqqani Network or TTA. Hence, to achieve peace in Afghanistan, Pakistan supports the new US strategy based on kinetic approach. The kinetic approach, which the US President Donald Trump announced on 21 August 2017, would mean use of military force to counter the terrorist groups’ that are active in Afghanistan. Although it is nothing new from Trump’s predecessor’s policy however, the new strategy is based on conditions rather than time-based approach of former President Barack Obama’s. The outcome of President Trump’s approach is yet to be seen.

- UN Secretary General António Guterres^{xxv} said that apart from all the challenges discussed during the two day conference, threats of cyber war and global climate changes too needs urgent addressing.

Some Recommendations/Suggestions that the Representatives Shared in MSC are the following:

Towards a Strong and Unified Europe

- Germany's Defence Minister Ursula von der Leyen said that Europe needs is a network security pact. The new coalition agreement in Germany is also based on this logic: the country has taken a new, unique step. It has decided that over the next four years, additional budgetary resources will focus on two areas: defense and development, which the German defence minister termed as Germany's NATO goal and ODA (Official Development Assistance) quota, equal in 1: 1 ratio. The rationale behind this is that in the foreseeable future this would lead to a significant real growth in financial resources for both areas. She attributed to the real growth in financial resources to the rise in economic output. With these agreements, Germany has for the first time bindingly agreed on a concrete "Networked Security Pact".^{xxvi}
- On building a future of a free, secure, prosperous and socially equitable Europe, German Foreign Minister Mr. Gabriel proposed the following:
 - The EU should launch its own initiative to promote the development of infrastructure from Eastern Europe to Central Asia and also in Africa (beyond development aid), with European money, but also by European standards.
 - Resolve the tension between Europe and Russia including the Ukrainian crisis through the Minsk Agreement.
- French Prime Minister Edouard Philippe^{xxvii} suggested that EU must address the "root causes" of its security risks, including migration.
- UK Prime Minister Ms. May floated the idea of a new security partnership between UK and EU after Brexit.
- NATO suggested that that to keep Europe safe, EU defence policies should be anchored within the transatlantic partnership.

EU as a Model for Others:

During the discussions, EU was hailed as a successful model by Qatar and South Korea.

- Sheikh Al-Thani suggested that Arab countries should take EU as a model to be adopted as it provides a framework for regional governance, and the peaceful arbitration of disputes.
- Ms. Minjoo, taking a leaf out of the EU unity, said that South Korea hopes to create peace and stability through a peace and economic model named 'New Economic Map'. Trust building measure is an important component between the two Korean countries for a peaceful solution.

On Rebuilding West Asia

- Iran's Foreign Minister Mr. Zarif suggested that to bring inclusive peace and security to the Persian Gulf region, there is a need for a 'fresh' regional architecture based on a collective effort. Some suggestions towards it were:
 - To identify mutual interest of each country and defeating hegemonic tendencies in the region is important.
 - From collective security and alliance formations to need for inclusive concepts such as security *networking*^{xxviii} which can address issues that range from divergence of interests to power and size disparities.
 - Like the Helsinki process, the future security architecture in the Persian Gulf should be based on the "ticket principles" and "CBM baskets"^{xxix}.
 - Confidence-building measures in the Persian Gulf: from joint military visits to pre-notification of military exercises; and from transparency measures in armament procurements to reducing military expenditures; all of which could eventually lead to a regional non-aggression pact.
 - Promotion of tourism, joint investments, or even joint task forces on issues ranging from nuclear safety to pollution to disaster management etc can be some projects that can be implemented amongst the countries to come together as a region.

On Afghanistan, Terrorism, Nuclear Threat and Other Threats

- On Afghanistan, Pakistan's General Bajwa said that a collective effort on the part of NATO and allies to conduct an audit and introspection to find out causes for this stalemate.
- On defeating jihadism/terrorism, Bajwa suggested that a strong and superior narrative is needed to counter the terrorist's narratives. Also, the cooperation and trust amongst the countries are important.
- On nuclear threats, the panellists of "Nuclear Security: Out of (Arms) Control?" suggested that the need of the hour is a frank discussion on the control of nuclear weapons linked with AI and cyber security threats. Arms control is another issue that needs urgent attention by the international community.
- On other threats, UN Secretary General Mr. Guterres said that multilateralism is the solution to problems such as cyber war and global climate change.

Wolfgang Ischinger^{xxx}, Ambassador, Chairman of the Munich Security Conference concluded the Munich Security Conference. He said that he thought the world could delete the question mark from the theme of the conference "To the Brink, and back?" but he was not 'fully sure' that the world can do that. He said that an array of global security issues, such as conflicts in West Asia, nuclear issue of Korean Peninsula, Iran, Syria, trans-Atlantic relations, European Union's efforts for deeper defence cooperation, Russia's problematic relations with Europe, global economic order, China's OBOR, a new security treaty between the European Union and Britain after Brexit etc. were discussed in a free and frank manner. Hence, a 'lot more work is ahead'. He suggested that the ideas which were floated during the conference need to be worked upon before the next MSC 2019 is held.

* Dr. Indrani Talukdar, Research Fellow, Indian Council of World Affairs, New Delhi.

Disclaimer: The views expressed are that of the Researcher and not of the Council.

Endnotes

ⁱThe MSC has expanded from a narrow transatlantic security framework to myriad global security threats and challenges such as terrorism, regional instabilities, global warming, cyberwarfare, advanced technology etc.

ⁱⁱThe themes that were discussed on 2017 were on a united or a divided EU, the future of the West, relevance of NATO, Asia-Pacific with the focus on East Asia and the Korean Peninsula, Faultlines of Eurasia, Franc-German view, Syria crisis, radicalism and terrorism, and climate and health security challenges.

ⁱⁱⁱ“Speech by President Jean-Claude Juncker on the occasion of the 54th Munich Security Conference”, *European Commission*, February 17, 2018. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_SPEECH-18-841_de.htm (Accessed on April 2, 2018).

^{iv}“Remarks by NATO Secretary General Jens Stoltenberg at the opening session of the Munich Security Conference”, NATO, February 16, 2018.

https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/opinions_152209.htm?selectedLocale=en (Accessed on March 23, 2018).

^vCharlsey Panzino, “More than 100 soldiers will deploy to Europe this spring”, *Army Times*, January 17, 2018.

<https://www.armytimes.com/news/your-army/2018/01/17/more-than-100-soldiers-will-deploy-to-europe-this-spring/> (Accessed on 28, 2018).

^{vi}“Prime Minister Yildirim addressed the participants at the main session of the 54th International Munich Conference”, *Turkey Republic Prime Minister*, February 18, 2018.

http://www.basbakanlik.gov.tr/Forms/_Article/pg_Article.aspx?Id=fab70375-3337-46a4-8fib-67d623a89cef (Accessed on April 4, 2018).

^{vii}“PM speech at Munich Security Conference: 17 February 2018”, *Gov.UK*, February 17, 2018.

<https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/pm-speech-at-munich-security-conference-17-february-2018> (Accessed on April 2, 2018).

^{viii}“Remarks by LTG H.R. McMaster at the Munich Security Conference”, *White House*, February 22, 2018.

<https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefings-statements/remarks-ltg-h-r-mcmaster-munich-security-conference/> (Accessed on March 4, 2018).

^{ix}Speech by President Jean-Claude Juncker on the occasion of the 54th Munich Security Conference”, *European Commission*, op.cit.

^x“Speech by Foreign Minister Sigmar Gabriel at the Munich Security Conference”, *Ministry of Foreign Affairs*, February 17, 2018. <https://www.auswaertiges-amt.de/de/newsroom/rede-muenchner-sicherheitskonferenz/1599848> Accessed on March 12, 2018.

^{xi}“Remarks by NATO Secretary General Jens Stoltenberg at the opening session of the Munich Security Conference”, NATO, op.cit.

^{xii}In this panel discussion on “Nuclear Security: Out of (Arms) Control?” the representatives were Kersti Kaljulaid, President of Republic of Estonia, Fu Ying (Chairwoman of the Committee on Foreign Affairs of the National People's Congress, Parliament of the People's Republic of China; Member of the Advisory Council, Munich Security Conference), Choo Mi-ae (Chairwoman, Minjoo Party of Korea; Member of the Committee on Foreign Relations and Unification of the National Assembly, Parliament of the Republic of Korea), Sergey Kislyak (First Deputy Chairman of the Committee on Foreign Affairs of the Council of Federation, Russian Federation; former Ambassador of the Russian Federation to the United States of America) and John Sullivan (Deputy Secretary of State, United States of America). “Nuclear Security: Out of (Arms) Control?” *Munich Security Conference 2018 Video*, February 16, 2018.

<https://www.securityconference.de/en/media-library/munich-security-conference-2018/video/panel-discussion-nuclear-security-out-of-arms-control/> (March 31, 2018).

^{xiii}US is committed to a continued suspension of nuclear testing.

^{xiv}Ms. Ying pointed out to Mr. Sullivan that US should not fear China because there is no reason for Beijing to threaten America. China has economic perk reserves in the US. She firmly pointed out to stop using China or any other country has an excuse for changing US' nuclear posture review. According to her, a dialogue between China, US and Russia is needed on threat assessment and removing the mistrusts.

^{xv}The panel consisted of Ernesto Zedillo (Former President of the United Mexican States; Member of The Elders Foundation; introduction), Christine Lagarde (Managing Director, International Monetary Fund) and Oliver Bäte (Chief Executive Officer, Allianz SE). “The Global Economic Order”, *Munich Security Conference 2018 Video*, February 16, 2018. <https://www.securityconference.de/en/media-library/munich-security-conference-2018/video/fireside-chat-the-global-economic-order/> (Accessed on April 10, 2018).

^{xvi}The panel did not discuss specifically on the challenge behind increased rate. However, they spoke about risks through highly expansionary fiscal and monetary policy based on ‘mistaken objectives and instruments to correct

macroeconomic imbalances'. This was in regard of foreign trade policies which the powerful economies are pursuing. Another risk was discussed on the downside risks in medium term are the financial vulnerabilities that are present in the system caused by the high leverage that has been accumulating over the years. Ibid. In a report by the UN, it talks about the risk to be faced in the year 2018 would be on the growing risk of having trade conflicts between major economies due to an increase of tariffs on imported goods by a particular country and the retaliatory measures by the other countries. "World Economic Situation and Prospects", *UN's Economic Analysis & Policy Division*, April 2018, Briefing No.113.

<https://www.un.org/development/desa/dpad/publication/world-economic-situation-and-prospects-april-2018-briefing-no-113/> (Accessed on May 29, 2018).

^{xvii}The Western Allied powers created the global economic system.

^{xviii}"The Return of Protectionism?" *Munich Security Conference 2018 Video*, February 16, 2018.

<https://www.securityconference.de/en/media-library/munich-security-conference-2018/video/fireside-chat-the-return-of-protectionism/> (Accessed on April 16, 2018).

^{xix}The German Foreign Minister, Sigmar Gabriel spoke on China's growing power including its OBOR initiative.

^{xx}Robert B. Zoellick (Former President of the World Bank) during the panel discussion on "The Return of Protectionism" spoke about the concern on China's technology and innovation agenda. He said that the tools which China uses or will be using in the future have the capacity to change their capabilities and take shape accordingly to the sector involved. The Return of Protectionism?" *Munich Security Conference 2018 Video*, February 16, 2018.

<https://www.securityconference.de/en/media-library/munich-security-conference-2018/video/fireside-chat-the-return-of-protectionism/> (Accessed on April 16, 2018).

^{xxi}Speech of His Highness Sheikh Tamim Bin Hamad Al-Thani Amir of the State of Qatar at the Munich Security Conference", *Qatar*, February 16-18, 2018.

https://www.securityconference.de/fileadmin/MSC_/2018/Hauptkonferenz/MSC2018_Reden/Speech_of_HH_The_Amir_in_the_Munich_Security_Conference_English_Version.pdf (Accessed on April 3, 2018).

^{xxii}Full text of FM Zarif's speech at the 54th edition of the Munich Security Conference", *Ministry of Foreign Affairs*, February 18, 2018. <http://en.mfa.ir/index.aspx?fkeyid=&siteid=3&pageid=2029&newsview=501055> (Accessed on April 4, 2018).

^{xxiii}"Jihadism after Caliphate", *Pakistan COAS*, February 17, 2018.

https://www.securityconference.de/fileadmin/MSC_/2018/Hauptkonferenz/MSC2018_Reden/MSC2018_speech_QamarJavedBajwa.pdf (Accessed on April 9, 2018).

^{xxiv}"Jihadism after Caliphate", *Pakistan COAS*, February 17, 2018.

https://www.securityconference.de/fileadmin/MSC_/2018/Hauptkonferenz/MSC2018_Reden/MSC2018_speech_QamarJavedBajwa.pdf (Accessed on April 9, 2018).

^{xxv}**António Guterres**, "Address at the Opening Ceremony of the Munich Security Conference", UN, February 18, 2018. <https://www.un.org/sg/en/content/sg/speeches/2018-02-16/address-opening-ceremony-munich-security-conference> (Accessed on February 26, 2018).

^{xxvi}"European, Stay transatlantic", Federal Ministry of Defence (Germany), op.cit.

^{xxvii}Michel Duclos, "Letter from Munich - World's Security "On the Brink"?" *Institut Montaigne*, February 20, 2018. <http://www.institutmontaigne.org/en/blog/letter-munich-worlds-security-brink> (Accessed on March 15, 2018).

^{xxviii}Security networking is a non-zero-sum approach that accepts that security is indivisible, as opposed to alliances and blocks, which are fundamentally based on the defunct zero-sum approach of gaining security at the expense of the insecurity of others.

^{xxix}All countries around this strategic yet volatile waterway should be able to enter by committing to a series of common standards enshrined in the UN Charter, such as sovereign equality of states; refraining from the threat or use of force; peaceful resolution of conflicts; respect for the territorial integrity; inviolability of borders; non-intervention in the domestic affairs of states; and respect for self-determination within states.

^{xxx}"Closing Remarks", *Munich Security Conference*, February 18, 2018.

<https://www.securityconference.de/en/media-library/munich-security-conference-2018/video/closing-remarks-by-wolfgang-ischinger-2/> (Accessed on April 16, 2018).