


एक दिवसीय परिचर्चा
भूमंडलीकरण के दौर में
भारत-भूटान संबंध: उभरती चुनौतियाँ
 21 मार्च 2017
 एम. एम. एच. कॉलेज, गाजियाबाद


प्रायोजक
 विश्व मामलों की भारतीय परिषद,
 सप्रू हाउस, नई दिल्ली

आयोजक
 भूगोल विभाग, एम. एम. एच. कॉलेज,
 गाजियाबाद



A Report
One Day Dialogue on
India- Bhutan Relations in the Era of Globalization: Emerging Challenges
 On 21st March, 2017
Organised by
 Department of Geography, MMH College, Ghaziabad (Uttar Pradesh)
Sponsored by
Indian Council of World Affairs (ICWA), New Delhi



Uttam Kumar, Convenor
 Department of Geography, MMH College, Ghaziabad, CCS University,

Content Page

A. Proceeding

Panel Discussion

Students Session

B. Annexures

1: Program Schedule

2: Media clip(s)

3: Participants List

A. Proceeding

A day long dialogue was organized by Department of Geography, M.M.H College Ghaziabad on following areas: .

- Political and economic background of India- Bhutan relationship
- Role of cultural dominance of India and Bhutan
- Vision of political leadership in foreign policy of India and Bhutan
- Future impact of globalization on India-Bhutan relationship

The panel discussion having subject experts from academia, bureaucracy and policy makers participated in the event. The panel discussion followed by a moderated session that promoted dialogue amongst postgraduate students to express their views on India- Bhutan Relationship. A number of postgraduate students from neighboring colleges and University spoke and shared their views on the theme. In this dialogue more than 150 teachers and students participated.

PANEL DISCUSSION

Panellist: Dr Madhuri Sukhija, Associate Professor, Delhi University; Dr Rajveer Singh, Assistant Professor, JNU; Ranjit Singh, IAS- Delhi Government, Chaired by Dr Bhisam Kapoor, Principal, MMH College, Ghaziabad and Dr Uttam Kumar, Convenor

Dr. Bhisam Kapoor, Principal of MMH College, in his welcome and inaugural remarks highlighted long association of MMH college with ICWA where secretary of MMH college was one of the founding member of ICWA in 1955. Dr Ramavati Bhatnagar, former secretary of MMH college, was associated with ICWA and interacted with first Prime Minister of India Pt. Jawaharlal Nehru on strengthening of ICWA. He welcomed all participants to the dialogue.

Dr Uttam Kumar, convenor and moderator of the event, talked about the importance of India and Bhutan relationship. He shared that in the era of globalisation every country wants to make relationship with those countries where they could get a big market. But Indo- Bhutan relation is a unique case



where India wants to maintain a good relationship with Bhutan while Bhutan gets market in India. This phenomenon could be because China is trying to lure Bhutan towards her side which will not be in favour of India strategically. He mentioned the prime Minister Narendra Modi made his maiden foreign visit, after assuming office, to Bhutan. It sent a strong message about importance of Bhutan to India. During the visit, he laid the foundation for Kholongchu Hydro-electric. He highlighted that due to unique geopolitical positioning of Bhutan, India needs to maintain a relation with her. *He also shared his first hand experience of his 10 days visit to Bhutan last year and his conversation with HRH Prince Jigyel Ugyen Wangchuck.*

In this context, he requested the panellists to discuss India- Bhutan Relationship particularly focussing on strategic importance of this relationship in India's favour and give their opinion on following areas:

- How could India maintain a good relationship in the changed political scenario of Bhutan?
- How could India keep Bhutan away from Chinese influence?
- How does technological development in India can be helpful in strengthening Indo-Bhutan relationship?

Afterwards, he requested **Dr Rajveer Singh**, Panellist from Centre for Studies in Science Policy, Jawaharlal Nehru University who is a visiting professor at T U Delf University, Netherlands and has extensive experience in the field of science and innovation to share his experience. Dr Singh mentioned that in 1949 India signed a treaty with Bhutan in which it was agreed that India will raise all military and economic issues on behalf of Bhutan at UN. The treaty outlines that Bhutan cannot make any foreign relation without India's consultation. It was further mentioned that Bhutan cannot allow its land to be used against India. He also mentioned that Bhutan has become constitutional democratic state from Monarchy. India has played a big role in this due to China's interest in Bhutan. It assumed that China could have various pressure groups to influence monarch.



He pointed out that Prime Minister Modi visited Bhutan with an idea of SAARC satellite especially in forecasting of disaster, disaster management techniques, planning, etc. Under this, Indian scientists will train Bhutanese scientists for local planning. It is India's strategic decision to provide this technology to Bhutan to ensure Bhutan's support for securing seat in UN security council. He mentioned that India has made steep stride in satellite technology and India can offer a lot to Bhutan. Presently, this technology is provided by various European countries to Bhutan.

Dr Madhuri Sukhija, Associate professor at Mata Sundari College, Delhi University, and a guest faculty at of Foreign Service Institute, Ministry of External affairs, Government of India shared her views on Bhutan- India relations. Dr Sukhija provided overview on Indo-Bhutan relation, china factor, Inter-relation of globalization and way forward She mentioned that Bhutan is the only nation that focuses on Gross Happiness Index, and



all policies - internal and external policies related to security, environment perseverance and socio-economic development work towards GHI. She highlighted that India and Bhutan has Treaty of friendship and cooperation, which was amended in 2007 where clause 2 was dropped. It implies that Bhutan does not have to seek advice from India; this change has brought India and Bhutan much closer. Dr Sukhija further emphasised that Siliguri corridors is vital for India, and Bhutan is trying to save this strategic position. Bhutan has also played a big role in removal of Militant Camps from Bhutan. In fact, Bhutan has supported India's position at international forums- therefore considered as a trusted friend. In recent times, Bhutan is negotiating with many countries due to high unemployment and debt burden on economy. India foreign policy needs to consider this aspect.

She highlighted that China is a big power in the world and China is almost equal to India at many fronts where has power in nuclear, hydro, high speed train. India needs to invest in Bhutan at many fronts including hydro-power, defence cooperation, economic inter-dependence and road connectivity.

Ranjit Singh, IAS, Joint Comminsor- Sales Tax, Delhi Government reflected on century old relationship between India and Bhutan. He highlighted that India- Bhutan relations are age old from 747 AD where sambhaji went to Bhutan to popularize Buddhism. He highlighted that India and Bhutan shares a lot of commonalities in terms of culture, religion and heritage. Bhutanese are nature and peace lovers and that is one of the reasons that country focuses on Gross Happiness Index. Given that Bhutan is a buffer state hence act as balance between China and India. In last 2-3 decades, Bhutan has enhanced its relations with China where china has invested in various projects in the country however love of Bhutanese towards India has not changed. Given increased interest of china in Bhutan especially proximity to Tibet, India needs to increase its relation with Bhutan in every possible way.



Dr Zakir Hussain, research fellow, representative of ICWA shared about role of ICWA in the field of foreign policy and its role in understanding foreign relation of India with other nations. He also shared about various programs and projects of ICWA.



OPEN DISCUSSION:

The panel discussion was followed by question and answer session. Following key questions were asked:

Bhutan turned from a monarchy system to democratic country in 2008. Has it affected Indo-Bhutan relationship? (Dr Sanjay Mishra, Department of Political Science, MMH College)

Dr Rajivir Singh replied that the change in Bhutan has further strengthened the relation since India helped Bhutan in setting up the democratic process. Dr Skhujia explained the reasons of democracy in Bhutan. Since Bhutan is a youngest democracy in the world, establishment will take time. Dr Uttam Kumar replied since bone of contention i.e. Entry 2A of 1949 treaty has been omitted in 2007/8, the relationship will become more strong between the two nations. This will further strengthen the democratization process in Bhutan.

Will Bhutan tilt towards China in future? (Aparna Thakur, A student from VMLG (PG) college)

Dr Rajivir Singh answered NO. Since Bhutan needs technology for its future development and India is helping in big way. This engagement will counter Chinese influence. Dr Madhuri Sukhija also opined that Bhutan has a strong cultural and religious affiliation with India hence there is a little change that It will look towards China.

What is good for Bhutan, Monarchy or Democracy? (Deepanshu, A student from MMH college)

Experts opined that both has negative and positive aspects, however in the era of globalization, democracy has edge over monarchy.



Dr N.C. Singh, co-convenor, extended thanking note to all panellist for their valuable contribution and opinion on India- Bhutan relations. He gave special thanks on behalf of the MMH College to ICWA for extending support to organise this important dialogue and hoped that ICWA will continue to support such events and endeavours in future. He also thanked all participants, students and teachers for their active participation.

STUDENTS SESSION



A post lunch session was organised in which post graduate students of various colleges were given an opportunity to share their views on Indo- Bhutan relationship. In the session, 15 postgraduate students from the departments of political science and geography of S.D. (PG) College, MMH College and VMLG (P.G.) College, Ghaziabad shared their views on Indo-Bhutan relation particularly social, political and economic aspects of the relationship. The student's session was chaired by **Dr. Rochan Mittal**, Head- Department of Political Science, SD (P.G.) College, Ghaziabad and co-chaired by **Dr. Yogesh Bhatti**, Delhi University. **Dr Ajay Upadhyay**, Associate professor, Department of political Science, SD college, Ghaziabad was the subject expert of the session.



B. Annexures



A DIALOGUE on
भूमंडलीकरण के दौर में भारत-भूटान संबंध: उभरती चुनौतिया
India- Bhutan Relations in the Era of Globalization: Emerging Challenges

On 21st March, 2017

Organized by

Dept. of Geography, MMH College, Ghaziabad, U.P.

Sponsored by

Indian Council of World Affairs (ICWA), New Delhi

PROGRAM SCHEDULE

Time	Agenda	Details
	Registration & Tea	
11.00-11.30 Am		Welcome by Dr. Bisham Kapoor, Principal, MMH College, Introduction to the Dialogue Uttam Kumar, Associate Professor and Convenor
11.30-1.30 PM	Panel Discussion	
		Speaker (S): 1. Dr. Madhuri Sukhija, Associate Professor, Department of Political Science , Mata Sundari College for Women, Delhi University 2. Dr Rajveer Singh SSS, Science Policy Centre, JNU and Visiting Professor TU Delf University Holland 3. Ranjeet Singh, IAS Joint commissioner, New Delhi 4. Dr. Zakir Hussain, Research Fellow, ICWA, New Delhi
1.30- 2.15PM		Lunch Break
2.15-3.30 PM	Student Session	Chair: Chair: Dr Ajay Upadhyay, Associate Professor, Department of Political Science S D College, Ghaziabad Presentations by Postgraduate Students 10
3.30-3.45 PM		Vote of Thanks Dr. N. C. Singh, Co-Convenor, Department of Geography, MMH College
		Tea